



Shire of Northam  
*Heritage, Commerce and Lifestyle*

## **Shire of Northam**

### **Minutes**

### **Special Council Meeting**

**27 February 2019**



## DISCLAIMER

In certain circumstances members of the public are not entitled to inspect material, which in the opinion of the Chief Executive Officer is confidential, and relates to a meeting or a part of a meeting that is likely to be closed to members of the public.

No responsibility whatsoever is implied or accepted by the Shire of Northam for any act, omission, statement or intimation occurring during Council or Committee meetings.

The Shire of Northam disclaims any liability for any loss whatsoever and howsoever caused arising out of reliance by any person or legal entity on any such act, omission or statement of intimation occurring during Council or Committee meetings.

Any person or legal entity who acts or fails to act in reliance upon any statement, act or omission made in a Council or Committee meeting does so at that person's or legal entity's own risk.

In particular and without derogating in any way from the broad disclaimer above, in any discussion regarding any planning application or application for a licence, any statement or intimation of approval made by any member or Officer of the Shire of Northam during the course of any meeting is not intended to be and is not taken as notice of approval from the Shire of Northam.

The Shire of Northam advises that anyone who has any application lodged with the Shire of Northam must obtain and should only rely on WRITTEN CONFIRMATION of the outcome of the application and any conditions attaching to the decision made by the Shire of Northam in respect of the application.

The Shire of Northam advises that any plans or documents contained within this agenda may be subject to copyright law provisions (*Copyright Act 1968*, as amended) and that the express permission of the copyright owner(s) should be sought prior to their reproduction. It should be noted that copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against any persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may represent a copyright infringement.

## Contents

1.	DECLARATION OF OPENING.....	4
2.	ATTENDANCE.....	4
2.1	APOLOGIES.....	4
2.2	APPROVED LEAVE OF ABSENCE .....	4
3.	DISCLOSURE OF INTERESTS.....	5
4.	ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE PRESIDING MEMBER (WITHOUT DISCUSSION) ....	5
5.	PUBLIC QUESTION TIME .....	5
5.1	PUBLIC QUESTIONS.....	5
6.	RESPONSE TO PREVIOUS PUBLIC QUESTIONS TAKEN ON NOTICE .....	7
7.	RECEIVING OF PETITIONS, PRESENTATIONS AND DEPUTATIONS .....	7
7.1	PETITIONS.....	7
7.2	PRESENTATIONS .....	7
7.3	DEPUTATIONS.....	8
8.	APPLICATION FOR LEAVE OF ABSENCE.....	8
9.	CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES .....	8
10.	ITEMS BROUGHT FORWARD FOR THE CONVENIENCE OF THOSE IN THE PUBLIC GALLERY .....	8
11.	REPORTS OF COMMITTEE MEETINGS .....	8
12.	SPECIAL ITEMS .....	9
12.1	MOTORISED MOBILITY DEVICE ACCESS-NORTHAM LIBRARY .....	9
12.2	TENDER 7 OF 2018 – SUPPLY AND LAY ARTIFICIAL HOCKEY PLAYING SURFACE.....	19
13.	MATTERS BEHIND CLOSED DOORS .....	24
14.	MOTIONS OF WHICH PREVIOUS NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN .....	24
15.	URGENT BUSINESS APPROVED BY PERSON PRESIDING OR BY DECISION .	24
16.	DECLARATION OF CLOSURE .....	24

## 1. DECLARATION OF OPENING

The Shire President, Cr C R Antonio declared the meeting open at 7:00pm.

## 2. ATTENDANCE

### Council:

Shire President

Deputy Shire President

Councillors

C R Antonio

M P Ryan

J E G Williams

C L Davidson

S B Pollard

A J Mencshelyi

T M Little

J Proud

C P Della

### Staff:

Chief Executive Officer

Executive Manager Engineering Services

Executive Manager Community Services

Executive Manager Corporate Services

Executive Assistant – CEO

HR Coordinator

Safety Officer

Killara Manager

J B Whiteaker

C D Kleynhans

R Rayson

C Young

A C McCall

B Jones

A Williams

N Hampton

### Gallery:

Avon Valley Advocate:

Public:

Eliza Wynn

Cherry Alexander

Joy Daniels

Brian Daniels

Ulo Rumjantsev

Matthew Pavlinovich

Sharron Williams

Jack Potter

Kim Hampton

2 x unknown

### 2.1 APOLOGIES

Executive Manager Development Services C B Hunt

### 2.2 APPROVED LEAVE OF ABSENCE

Cr R W Tinetti has been granted leave of absence from 16 February 2019 to 25 March 2019 (inclusive).

### 3. DISCLOSURE OF INTERESTS

Item Name	Item No.	Name	Type of Interest	Nature of Interest
Motorised Mobility Device Access-Northam Library	12.1	Cr A J Mencshelyi	Impartiality	He knows the person referred to as "one specific individual" in the agenda item. The extent of his interest is very minimal, he has spoken to him a number of times.
Tender 7 of 2018 – Supply and Lay Artificial Hockey Playing Surface	12.2	Cr C R Antonio	Impartiality	Previous President of Avon Hockey Association. On Executive Committee of Northam Hockey Club.
		Cr M P Ryan	Impartiality	His children are members of the Northam Hockey Club.
		Cr C P Della	Impartiality	He is a member of the Avon Hockey Association who will benefit from the installation.
		Mr J B Whiteaker	Impartiality	He is a hockey player.

Ms Eliza Wynn departed the Council Chambers at 7:02pm and returned at 7:02pm. One (1) unknown member of the Gallery entered the meeting at 7:02pm.

### 4. ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE PRESIDING MEMBER (WITHOUT DISCUSSION)

Nil.

### 5. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

#### 5.1 PUBLIC QUESTIONS

**Name:** Cherry Alexander.

**Summary of Question 1:** In relation to agenda item 12.1, can Councillors put themselves in the same situation? There are a number of people within the community who have a disability.

**Summary of Response 1:** The Shire President advised Council can consider this when dealing with the agenda item.

**Name:** Brian Daniels.

**Summary of Question 1:** At the beginning of the meeting reference was made to a 'specific individual'. Can Council confirm that the matter being dealt with in agenda item 12.1 is in relation to gopher access at the Northam Library?

**Summary of Response 1:** The Shire President confirmed that Council is considering gopher access to the Northam Library and clarified that he was reading from the disclosures of interest which is as declared by the Elected Members, when he referenced the specific individual.

---

**Name:** Matthew Pavlinovich.

**Summary of Question 1:** How many Shire of Northam buildings are not compliant with disability legislation/requirements?

**Summary of Response 1:** The Chief Executive Officer took the question on notice. It was advised that he is not aware of any specific compliance issues. It was advised that an audit was undertaken on the Northam Library and considered by Council at its August 2018 Council meeting. Council resolved that an action plan was to be prepared to address the issues, the action plan was subsequently endorsed at the January 2019 Council meeting.

---

**Name:** Cherry Alexander.

**Summary of Question 1:** How long has Council had funding for upgrades at the Northam Library.

**Summary of Response 1:** The Chief Executive Officer advised that the funding was allocated in the current 2018/19 budget which is an amount of \$50,000. The matter was on hold until the audit was undertaken at the Northam Library and the action plan from this was endorsed by Council, this occurred in January 2019.

---

**Name:** Brian Daniels.

**Summary of Question 1:** The Shire of Northam's Disability Access and Inclusion Plan 2014-2018 (DAIP) details that all Council buildings will be upgraded to allow disability access. Why has this not occurred and now four (4) years on, a new plan is required?

**Summary of Response 1:** The Chief Executive Officer advised that the DAIP and strategies within this are contingent on funding.

---

**Name:** Cherry Alexander.

**Summary of Question 1:** Has Councillors witnessed a gopher manoeuvring on a Trans Perth bus?

**Summary of Response 1:** The Shire President advised that Councillors have not witnessed this as a group. It was advised that many Councillors have been on Trans Perth buses however is unsure if they have witnessed a gopher on the bus.

---

## 6. RESPONSE TO PREVIOUS PUBLIC QUESTIONS TAKEN ON NOTICE

Nil.

## 7. RECEIVING OF PETITIONS, PRESENTATIONS AND DEPUTATIONS

### 7.1 PETITIONS

Nil.

### 7.2 PRESENTATIONS

Nil.

### 7.3 DEPUTATIONS

**Name:** Jack Potter.

- Summary of Statement:**
- Outlined that he is the aggrieved individual referenced within the report for agenda item 12.1.
  - Raised that he was visited by a Councillor today who put forward a suggestion and he hoped that Council would consider this.
  - Outlined that this continuing is doing anyone any good.
  - Requested that all involved be grown up and there be no more viciousness and slander.
  - Hoped that all could forget the ugliness that had taken place, start again and return to the January 2018 situation.

### 8. APPLICATION FOR LEAVE OF ABSENCE

#### RECOMMENDATION / COUNCIL DECISION

**Minute No:** C.3598

**Moved:** Cr Williams  
**Seconded:** Cr Mencshelyi

**That Council grant Cr T M Little leave of absence from 1 March 2019 to 18 March 2019 (inclusive).**

**CARRIED 9/0**

### 9. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Nil.

### 10. ITEMS BROUGHT FORWARD FOR THE CONVENIENCE OF THOSE IN THE PUBLIC GALLERY

Nil.

### 11. REPORTS OF COMMITTEE MEETINGS

Nil.



## 12. SPECIAL ITEMS

Cr A J Mencshelyi declared an "Impartiality" interest in item 12.1 - Motorised Mobility Device Access-Northam Library as he knows the person referred to as "one specific individual" in the agenda item. The extent of his interest is very minimal, he has spoken to him a number of times.

### 12.1 MOTORISED MOBILITY DEVICE ACCESS-NORTHAM LIBRARY

<b>Address:</b>	298 Fitzgerald Street, Northam
<b>Owner:</b>	Shire of Northam
<b>Applicant:</b>	Shire of Northam
<b>File Reference:</b>	1.3.1.3
<b>Reporting Officer:</b>	Jason Whiteaker Chief Executive Officer
<b>Responsible Officer:</b>	Jason Whiteaker Chief Executive Officer
<b>Officer Declaration of Interest:</b>	Impartiality – have been subject to a range of personal attacks by the individual referenced in this report
<b>Voting Requirement:</b>	Simple Majority
<b>Press release to be issued:</b>	Yes.

#### BRIEF

For Council to consider access arrangements to the Northam Library for a motorised mobility devices.

#### ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Provided as a separate confidential attachment.

#### BACKGROUND / DETAILS

In February 2018, The Manager of Digital Information and Innovation (MDII), as the Manager of Northam Library, made a determination regarding allowing access to the Northam Library for Mobility Scooters (Gophers). The MDII made the assessment based on a range of Occupational Health and Safety concerns, including those of patrons and library staff. These Occupational Health and Safety concerns included, but were not limited to:

- Concern for patrons, particularly the elderly and young children, that the Northam Library, due to its age and design, was considered to not

be configured to cope with the use of gophers within the small confines due to the speed and manoeuvrability.

- Concern for staff, who were previously physically assisting some gopher users, into and out of a chair into the lift, and to the public access computers upstairs. Staff were also physically assisting some gopher users to the toilet facilities. This practice is dangerous to staff, who were not trained in manual handling of patrons, and are not employed to undertake such duties.

To assist those library patrons that use gophers to access library facilities, a number of steps were put in place. These included:

- Provision of a wheelchair and walking frame for use of those patrons to provide access when in the library.
- Provision of computer facilities on the ground floor of the Library to enable those patrons to have access to the internet, online catalogue etc.
- Staff assisting patrons with retrieving books off shelves.
- Patrons were also advised of other Library services available to them, such as the house bound book deliveries.

These arrangements appear to have been generally accepted by the majority of gopher users, with the exception of one specific individual. Other members of the library who utilise gophers are currently adhering to the policy with little or no inconvenience.

There are two issues which have been confronting staff over the past ten months, being

1. The appropriateness of a gopher utilising the Northam library, whilst providing a safe environment for both staff and members of the community;
2. The sordid behaviour of one aggrieved individual, which has been directed at the staff of the Shire of Northam

Whilst the focus of this report is on the first matter, it is important for Council to understand the second matter as context to current complaints being directed toward the staff, who at all times have remained professional and polite.

- 1. The appropriateness of a gopher utilising the Northam library, whilst providing a safe environment for both staff and members of the community;**

- There is a distinct lack of information / standards / precedents in relation to gopher access to public facilities
- There is currently a parliamentary enquiry into the Need for regulation of mobility scooters, also known as motorised wheelchairs. This highlights the challenge around gopher use in general, let alone use inside public buildings. ([https://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary\\_Business/Committees/Senate/Rural\\_and\\_Regional\\_Affairs\\_and\\_Transport/MobilityScooters/Report/c02](https://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary_Business/Committees/Senate/Rural_and_Regional_Affairs_and_Transport/MobilityScooters/Report/c02))
- Staff consulted with the gopher users in an attempt to develop a strategy to ensure the users ongoing access to the library, whilst maintaining a safe environment for staff and other patrons. All gopher users are adhering to the new arrangements, with little or no complaint or impact on library use
- As a result of ongoing concerns in relation to access, staff spent a considerable amount of time trying to identify other local governments across Australia who had dealt with a similar issue – unfortunately staff were unable to find anything that was similar
- Staff attempted to identify an ‘expert’ in the disability access industry who would address the gopher issue, unfortunately due to the lack of regulations or standards, staff were unable to find anyone to look at the matter specifically
- The main issue appears to be that the current legislation references applicable Australian Standards, in this case Australian Standard AS1428.1 (2009). This standard provides minimum mandatory technical access requirements to ensure compliance, however, there is a gap in their accessibility provisions in a number of areas, particularly gophers
- Due to the above, the Access Auditors are unable to provide specific advice on the access issues for gophers
- Staff did however undertake a general disability access audit, which was presented to Council – August 2018. As a result of the audit Council resolved;

**RECOMMENDATION / COUNCIL DECISION**

**Minute No: C.3456**

**Moved: Cr Williams**

**Seconded: Cr Ryan**

**That Council:**

- 1. Receives the Disability Access Audit Report prepared for Northam Library;**
- 2. Request officers to prepare a Disability Action Plan for Northam Library, and adjacent former Council office to be presented to Council for endorsement, prior to implementation; and**
- 3. Reaffirms the position of the Chief Executive Officer to not allow gopher access into the library at this time and reviews this position on receipt of the Disability Action Plan.**

**CARRIED 8/0**

- Subsequent to Council resolution of August 2018, officers commissioned a Disability Access Action report for Northam Library, which was presented for Council in January 2019, where council resolved the following:

**RECOMMENDATION / COUNCIL DECISION**

**Minute No: C.3583**

**Moved: Cr Little**

**Seconded: Cr Della**

**That Council:**

- 1. Endorse the draft Disability Action Plan prepared for Northam Library; and**
- 2. Endorse the Action List, and timeframes, as outlined in the Disability Action Plan Strategies & Timeframes Table (Attachment 3) authorising expenditure from the following accounts:**
  - **Sewer Line (11359004);**
  - **Repairs to Exterior Steps (11359004); and**
  - **General Building Maintenance (unspecified), (11359004).**
- 3. Endorse an allocation of \$12,704 be included in the 2019/20 Draft Budget to complete the items detailed within the Disability Action Plan Strategies & Timeframes Table (Attachment 3) which also takes into consideration changes to legislation for mobility scooters where practicable.**

**CARRIED 7/1**

Officers are now in the process of actioning the items as listed in the report.

- Council staff have also had an independent risk assessment undertaken by Local Government Insurance Services. Staff were very clear that while the aggrieved individual had

certainly personalised this issue, the requirement was for an objective assessment of whether Council, from an OHS and Risk perspective, should allow gopher access into the library. The verbal advice provided by LGIS is to support the position of the Chief Executive Officer in not allowing direct access into the library by gophers due to the unreasonable risk this creates for staff and patrons (full report will be made available)

- A complaint was made by the aggrieved individual to the Equal Opportunity Commission (EOC). Staff have been providing information over the past 4 months, there has been no determination to this point. The EOC has indicated they would like to arrange conciliation between the parties. The Chief Executive Officer has indicated some concern given the behaviour of the individual and this issue being about the access in general, as opposed to the access of this particular individual only. However the Chief Executive Officer has agreed, at this stage to proceed with some form of conciliation. As yet no confirmation has been received if the aggrieved individual is prepared to enter into discussions.
- An action was commenced against Council, the lawyers appointed by the aggrieved individual, in relation to the disability discrimination act, however this action was ceased on the advice of the lawyers.

## **2. The sordid behaviour of one aggrieved individual, which has been directed at the staff of the Shire of Northam**

While the behaviour of this individual is not the 'nub' of the issue, it certainly has contributed to some of the outcomes that have occurred. As a consequence it is felt appropriate for Council to have a clear understanding of these matters in making an informed determination on these matters.

- In relation to this aggrieved individual, initial discussions were held in regard to what was proposed (i.e. not allowing gophers into the library).
- The aggrieved individual objected to this decision, citing that he needs to access the library on his gopher due to mobility issues.
- Following initial discussions with this individual, a number of meetings and investigations have taken place to try and assist the persons desire to utilise the library whilst also providing a safe environment for library employees and patrons. This included a meeting on 16 March with Council staff, Jason Whiteaker (CEO, Ross Rayson (Executive Manager Community Services) and Nicole Hampton (Manager Killara). Ms

Hampton was included due to her knowledge in the area of aged and Disability Services.

- At the aforementioned meeting, there was a verbal agreement with the aggrieved individual on an access plan, without driving his gopher into the library, which was to be trialled for a period of one month and then reassessed. A letter which was sighted at the meeting, stated the individual had limited mobility, but was able to walk short distances of up to 15 metres. The trial involved the library staff providing assistance to this person once in the library, such as pushing him in the provided wheelchair, provision of a lap top computer on the ground floor, and assisting with retrieving books from the shelves when requested.
- The aggrieved individual has never attended the library under those conditions, but instead commenced a series of attacks both in person and in writing, (mostly personal and of an abusive nature) directed at the CEO, Library Manager, and to a lesser extent Executive Manager Community Services and Killara Manager.
- Since the initial meeting with the aggrieved individual, Council staff have been subjected to a constant barrage of attack, some verbal and some in written form. A chronology of events, and correspondence is attached under separate cover. In particular the CEO and Library Manager, but also Executive Manager Community Services and Manager Killara, have been the subject of many, mostly public documents, containing very graphic and personal allegations. Officers are concerned about the welfare of all staff in the library, who have expressed concerns about their personal safety when confronted by this person, and who have been subject to, or witness to, some appalling and disgusting language and behaviour from this individual towards their Manager.
- This individual was banned from the Library for a period of two months, in July 2018, due to his behaviour, which included offensive and insulting language directed to staff members.
- This individual has been the subject of a Misconduct Restraining Order, taken out by a library staff member independently of Council, which restricted his access to the library until end of January 2019. Whilst the MRO has been lifted, the individual has been instructed by the Court that he is not to take his Gopher into the library until granted permission to do so. He has broken that court order twice since 1 February 2019.
- This person has also signed an undertaking at court to be polite to library staff and to obey the rules of the Library. He has contravened that undertaking at least twice since 1 February 2019.

- This individual attended the Council Forum meeting of 13 February 2019 to question whether he is allowed to enter the Library.

## CONSIDERATIONS

### **Strategic Community / Corporate Business Plan**

#### Theme Area 2 - Community Well Being

Outcome 2.1-People in the Shire of Northam feel that their community is caring and inclusive

### **Financial / Resource Implications**

Council has committed funding of approximately \$95,000 over the next 2 financial years to implement the recommendations of the Access Audit Action Plan. Additional alterations to Library design and configuration will come at a cost, yet to be determined.

### **Legislative Compliance**

Disability Discrimination Act 1992.

Disability (Access to Premises-Buildings) Standards 2010.

Australian Human Rights Commission Act 1986.

### **Policy Implications**

Nil.

### **Stakeholder Engagement / Consultation**

The Disability Access Audit and Action Plan were prepared by an Access consultant for the Shire of Northam. Staff engaged fully with the aggrieved individual in the initial stages to formulate a plan to access the Library. The plan was never enacted by the complainant.

### **Risk Implications**

- Reputational –High
  - This is an extremely unfortunate set of circumstance and outcome. Council does risk significant risk of reputational damage as a result of the position that has been taken previously. This could be mitigated to an extent by ensuring the community understands the background and decision making process applied in coming to the current position.
- Financial - Moderate
  - Council may be exposed to insurance claims for any injuries which occur as a result of gophers accessing the library building.
- Compliance - Moderate
  - The risk with allowing access is that the Shire of Northam potentially will be in breach of legislation, which could result in prosecution and financial penalty. However, this has been mitigated by the creation of an Access Audit and Action Plan, which provides Council a clear direction under current legislation.

- Legal –Moderate
  - It is unlawful for a person who, whether for payment or not, provides goods or services, or makes facilities available, to discriminate against another person on the ground of the other person's disability. Advice received to date is that Council is complying with its legislative requirements.

## OFFICER'S COMMENT

Council has a number of options available to it in relation to this matter. These options are explored below;

- *Not allow Gophers into the Library.* From a compliance point of view, as there is no clear legislation on the use of gophers it is difficult for Council to make a decision based compliance. As stated in council report of 23 January 2019, officers are working on correcting issues of access as identified in the Access Action Plan, and are reviewing Library operations based on information they have in relation to these devices. It is unknown whether, once any changes are made, there will be a requirement for further changes once legislation is drafted. (e.g.' the current lift requires work to make sure it is compliant. Under new legislation, there may be a requirement to alter the lift again, at significant cost.
- Not allow Gophers into the library, however adding that Council direct the Chief Executive Office to continue to explore options for safe entry into library for gopher users, in the context of ensuring the risk and service delivery to staff and other library users is acceptable / manageable. This is similar to the first option with the added requirement for the Chief Executive Officer to continue to explore viable options for entry of gophers into the library. Whilst this may not be possible, it should still be incumbent on the Council to explore options and avenues to allow access to the library by gopher users – which would be the most beneficial outcome to not only the gopher users, but also the Council.
- *Provide special permission for the aggrieved individual only to access the Library in his gopher.* It is unclear whether this would be seen as discrimination by other gopher users, who currently utilise the Library and park outside.
- *Allow access to gophers into the Library, on a conditional basis.* – Could potentially be seen as discriminatory as it is not providing full access to Council services. This would at least allow a level of risk mitigation / management. For example Council could allow access for 2 hours from 10am each Friday.



- *Allow full access to gophers unconditionally:* What will need to be determined is the cost both financially and in service provision, that would result if modifications were required to the Library for this to occur.

In addition there are certainly concerns from staff in relation to the method adopted by the aggrieved individual in dealing with his specific concerns. Whilst the individual is within their rights to express their views in public forums on any range of matters, any such behaviour which is threatening toward staff in or around Council facilities will be dealt with strongly and will result in banning the individual from attending Council facilities.

## RECOMMENDATION

### That Council:

1. **Reaffirms the current position of Council and the Chief Executive Officer to not allow gopher access into the library, until such time as it can be demonstrated that access can be granted in a manner which is safe to both staff and other library users.**
2. **Directs the Chief Executive Office to continue to explore options for safe entry into library for gopher users, in the context of ensuring the risk and service delivery to staff and other library users is acceptable.**
3. **Requests the Chief Executive Officer to keep the Shire President informed on progress of completion of the actions from the Disability Action Plan and the endeavours to provide safe access to the library by gopher users.**

Cr Mencshelyi moved the Officer recommendation subject to the words 'in the shortest practicable time' being inserted after the word 'explore' in item 2 of the recommendation.

**MOTION / COUNCIL DECISION**

**Minute No: C.3599**

**Moved: Cr Mencshelyi**

**Seconded: Cr Ryan**

**That Council:**

- 1. Reaffirms the current position of Council and the Chief Executive Officer to not allow gopher access into the library, until such time as it can be demonstrated that access can be granted in a manner which is safe to both staff and other library users.**
- 2. Directs the Chief Executive Office to continue to explore in the shortest practicable time options for safe entry into library for gopher users, in the context of ensuring the risk and service delivery to staff and other library users is acceptable.**
- 3. Requests the Chief Executive Officer to keep the Shire President informed on progress of completion of the actions from the Disability Action Plan and the endeavours to provide safe access to the library by gopher users.**

**CARRIED 9/0**

Cr C R Antonio declared an "Impartiality" interest in item 12.2 - Tender 7 of 2018 – Supply and Lay Artificial Hockey Playing Surface as he is the previous President of Avon Hockey Association. On Executive Committee of Northam Hockey Club.

Cr M P Ryan declared an "Impartiality" interest in item 12.2 - Tender 7 of 2018 – Supply and Lay Artificial Hockey Playing Surface as his children are members of the Northam Hockey Club.

Cr C P Della declared an "Impartiality" interest in item 12.2 - Tender 7 of 2018 – Supply and Lay Artificial Hockey Playing Surface as he is a member of the Avon Hockey Association who will benefit from the installation.

Mr J B Whiteaker declared an "Impartiality" interest in item 12.2 - Tender 7 of 2018 – Supply and Lay Artificial Hockey Playing Surface as he is a hockey player.

## 12.2 TENDER 7 OF 2018 – SUPPLY AND LAY ARTIFICIAL HOCKEY PLAYING SURFACE

<b>Address:</b>	Bert Hawke Reserve, Northam
<b>Owner:</b>	Shire of Northam
<b>Applicant:</b>	Shire of Northam
<b>File Reference:</b>	8.2.9.1
<b>Reporting Officer:</b>	Sue Connell
<b>Responsible Officer:</b>	Clinton Kleynhans
<b>Officer Declaration of Interest:</b>	Jason Whiteaker – Chief Executive Officer - impartiality as a current member of the Northam hockey club
<b>Voting Requirement:</b>	Majority
<b>Press release to be issued:</b>	Yes

### BRIEF

For Council to approve the award of RFT 7 of 2018 for Supply and Lay Artificial Hockey Playing Surface (subject to conditions).

### ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1: Evaluation Report (confidential).  
Attachment 2: Evaluation Matrix (confidential).

---

### BACKGROUND / DETAILS

Request for tenders were called on the 6<sup>th</sup> October 2108 in the West Australian. The tender closed on Friday 31<sup>st</sup> October 2018.

Tenderers were invited to provide a tendered price to deliver works under contract to Supply and Lay an Artificial Hockey Playing Surface as directed by the Principal or its nominated representative.

Employee's present at the tender opening were Councils Governance Officer and Executive Manager Engineering Services.

Tenders were independently assessed by the Executive Manager Community Services, Executive Manager Developments Services, and Purchasing Officer.

## **CONSIDERATIONS**

### **Strategic Community / Corporate Business Plan**

Theme Area: Community Wellbeing

Outcome 2.2: There are a variety of recreation and leisure activities available for all ages, across the Shire of Northam.

- Maintain a range of sporting facilities in Northam, as expected of a Regional Centre.
- To have well maintained reserves within the Shire of Northam.

### **Financial / Resource Implications**

An amount of \$400,000 has been included in the adopted 2018/19 Budget for the delivery of this project.

The following budget summary is provided for stage one of the turf project, stage 2 (which includes lighting, electronic scoreboard, additional perimeter fencing and spectator seating) is currently subject to a Federal Grant application which is due to be announced in late December 2018. In the event this funding is unsuccessful, the hockey club will look at alternative grant opportunities. Stage 1 can however continue in isolation.

<b>HOCKEY TURF BUDGET ESTIMATES</b>						
				ALL FIGURES EX GST		
				QUOTE	PROPOSED	
Base costs	DSR Budget			175,625		
	ACTUAL				<b>175,625</b>	
Asphalt & Kerbing	Supercivil	A & K	3 quotes received	121,293	<b>121,293</b>	
Shockpad	TT		Tendered	358,870	<b>358,870</b>	
Fencing	Midalia	materials	Quotes received	12,500	<b>12,500</b>	
<b>TOTAL TURF INSTALL</b>					<b>668,288</b>	
				Funded By:-		
					- 6,363	
					- 261,925	
					- 400,000	
<b>TOTAL TURF FUNDING</b>					<b>-668,288</b>	

The Hockey Association have an additional \$40,000 in cash available for contingency. If this is not required, the intent is to utilise these funds to leverage stage 2 through the State CSRFF if the Federal application is unsuccessful.

### Legislative Compliance

Section 3.57 of the Local Government Act 1995;

Local Government (Functions & General) Regulations 1996 prescribe the manner that Tenders are called and awarded.

In addition to the above, Council has an adopted Policy with respect to Regional Price Preference as set out below:

### Policy Implications

*"F 3.4 Regional Price Preference*

**Policy:** *Council's Regional Price Preference for locally produced goods and services will apply to all goods and services for which tenders are let, unless the Shire of Northam determines otherwise, and is to be:*

*Up to 10% where the contract is for goods or services (including construction (building) services), up to the maximum price reduction of \$100,000, if the Local Government is seeking tenders for the provision of those goods or services for the first time due to*

*those goods or services having been, until then, undertaken by the local government"*

This policy has been applied within the tender assessment process.

### **Stakeholder Engagement / Consultation**

The Hockey Association have been consulted in relation to their preferred surface.

### **Risk Implications**

- Reputational – Low
  - In the event there is an issue with the project, Council risks a level of reputational damage. This is considered more of a risk as various elements of the project are being delivered independent to the Council
- Financial - Low
  - No significant financial concern as Council has a set budget.
- Compliance - Medium
  - As the site works are being undertaken by a third party, as an in-kind contribution to the project, there is a risk in the event the works do not meet specification. This is being mitigated by the requirement for a geotechnical assessment of the works prior to the asphalt being laid, whilst the asphalt specification provided by the turf supplier is being provided to the contractor to ensure compliance. Engineering Services staff will sign off on these elements as hold points for the project.
- Legal – Low
  - Following Purchasing and Tenders Process.

### **OFFICER'S COMMENT**

The submissions were assessed against the following pre-determined criteria's:

#### Compliance Criteria

- Compliance with the conditions in the request;
- Compliance with Specification;
- Financial capacity to perform the works;
- Intent to Sub-Contract;
- Declare any conflict of interest;
- Quality Assurance;
- Occupational Health and Safety requirements;
- Insurance coverage;
- Public consultation

#### Qualitative Criteria (Scored)

- |                                     |     |
|-------------------------------------|-----|
| • Pricing                           | 50% |
| • Relevant Experience               | 25% |
| • Timeliness of Delivery/resourcing | 15% |

- Safety and Risk Management 10%

Further detail is provided in the attached Appendices.

The Evaluation Panel recommends the contract be awarded to Tiger Turf, as the preferred supplier.

In relation to the other elements it is also recommended that the Council oversees the purchase of these items. This is being recommended to ensure that the project is delivered effectively (given the considerable financial commitment of the Council), whilst also maximising the Council funding available, as Council is able to claim back the GST, whereas the hockey association is not.

#### **RECOMMENDATION / COUNCIL DECISION**

**Minute No: C.3600**

**Moved: Cr Pollard**

**Seconded: Cr Mencshelyi**

**That Council, subject to the Chief Executive Officer being satisfied that the Northam Hockey Club is able to proceed with stage 1 of the project in full;**

- 1. Award Tender 7 of 2018 for the Supply and installation of an Evo Pro Artificial Hockey Playing Surface to Tiger Turf for the sum of \$358,870 (GST exclusive);**
- 2. Authorise expenditure of up to \$400,000 to deliver all elements of stage 1 of the project.**
- 3. Authorise additional expenditure of up to \$40,000 to be reimbursed by the Northam Hockey Association.**

**CARRIED 9/0**

Clarification was sought in relation to the life expectancy. The Chief Executive Officer advised that this is approximately 15 years however this is impacted by a range of factors and can vary. Further clarification was sought in relation to whether another \$400,000 would be required in 15 years. The Chief Executive Officer clarified that the \$400,000 includes all of the site works, shock pads and surface. Only the top surface is required to be replaced, this is currently costed at approximately \$150,000. The Shire President clarified that this would also be the Hockey Associations expense.

**13. MATTERS BEHIND CLOSED DOORS**

Nil.

**14. MOTIONS OF WHICH PREVIOUS NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN**

Nil.

**15. URGENT BUSINESS APPROVED BY PERSON PRESIDING OR BY DECISION**

Nil.

**16. DECLARATION OF CLOSURE**

There being no further business, the Shire President, Cr C R Antonio declared the meeting closed at 7:18pm.

"I certify that the Minutes of the Special Meeting of Council held on Wednesday, 27 February 2019 have been confirmed as a true and correct record."

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
President

20/03/2019 Date